

The Honorable Thomas S. Zilly

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

NUJUD MURIBY,

Case No. 2:18-cv-01477-TSZ

Plaintiff,

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

**WELLS FARGO BANK, N.A., and
EXPERIAN INFORMATION
SOLUTIONS, INC.**

Defendants.

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential information under seal.

1
2. **“CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL**

2 “Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things produced
3 or otherwise exchanged:

4 a. information that a party has a reasonable and good faith belief contains a
5 trade secret, including, but not limited to, Experian’s Disclosure logs, D/R logs, Transaction logs,
6 and Admin reports;

7 b. research, technical, commercial or financial information that the party has
8 maintained as confidential, and that, if disclosed to customers or competitors, would tend to damage
9 the party's competitive position; or

10 c. information and documents that a party has a reasonable and good faith belief
11 constitutes, contains, or refers to proprietary technology or information owned or developed by the
12 producing party, and that, if disclosed to customers or competitors, would tend to damage the party's
13 competitive position, including, but not limited to, Experian’s Disclosure logs, D/R logs,
14 Transaction logs, and Admin reports;

15 d. Wells Fargo’s Policies and Procedures or similar documents;

16 e. Credit reporting documents pertaining to Plaintiff or his brother Richard
17 Muriby (including ACDVs and AUDs);

18 f. Wells Fargo account(s) information or history, including collection and
19 credit reporting;

20 g. Any and all information concerning Wells Fargo’s customers other than
21 Plaintiff;

22 h. Any proprietary information concerning Wells Fargo’s business practices or
23 operations;

24 i. Any additional materials deemed to be confidential by an agreement between
25 the parties or Order of the court.

1 3. SCOPE

2 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as defined
3 above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2) all copies,
4 excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
5 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

6 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
7 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

8 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

9 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
10 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
11 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to the
12 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential material
13 must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures
14 that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

15 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered
16 by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any
17 confidential material only to:

18 (a) the receiving party’s counsel of record in this action, as well as employees
19 of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

20 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the
21 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
22 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney’s Eyes Only and is so
23 designated;

24 (c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this
25 litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

- (d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;
- (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

(f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this agreement;

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue, and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

1
2 5. **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

3 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party or
4 non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take care
5 to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The
6 designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or
7 oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the material, documents, items,
8 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the
ambit of this agreement.

9 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown
10 to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to unnecessarily
11 encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens
12 on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

13 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for
14 protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties
15 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

16 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this agreement
17 (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered,
18 disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must be clearly
19 so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

20 (a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents and
21 deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings),
22 the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains
23 confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection,
24 the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate
25 markings in the margins).

(b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within thirty days after receiving the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

(c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection, the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party's right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other

1 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list
2 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-
3 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

4 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
5 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local
6 Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of persuasion
7 in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an
8 improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties)
9 may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material
10 in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

11 7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
12 LITIGATION

13 If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
14 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party
15 must:

16 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the
17 subpoena or court order;

18 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
19 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is
20 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

21 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by
22 the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

23 8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential
25 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving
26 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures,
 (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the

1 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement,
2 and (d) request that such person or persons execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
3 Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

4 **9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED**
5 **MATERIAL**

6 When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently produced
7 material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the receiving parties
8 are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to
9 modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or agreement that provides
10 for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the entry of a non-waiver order
11 under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

12 **10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS**

13 Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving
14 party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and
15 summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

16 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all
17 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence, deposition
18 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product,
19 even if such materials contain confidential material.

20 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a
21 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 DATED this 28th day of March, 2019.

3 /s/ Christopher E. Green

4 Christopher E Green, WSBA ID 19410
5 Christopher E. Green, Attorney At Law
6 225 106th Ave. NE
7 Bellevue, WA 98004
Phone: 206-686-4558
Email: chris@myfaircredit.com

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

9 /s/ Jeremy E. Shulman

10 Jeremy E Shulman, *pro hac vice*
AFRCT, LLP
301 North Lake Ave., Ste 1100
Pasadena, CA 91101
Phone: 626-535-1900
Email: jshulman@afrct.com

11 *Attorneys for Defendant Wells Fargo Bank,
N.A.*

12 /s/ Angela M. Taylor

13 Angela M. Taylor, *pro hac vice*
JONES DAY
14 3161 Michelson Drive, Suite 800
Irvine, CA 92612
Email: angelataylor@jonesday.com

15 *Attorneys for Defendant Experian
Information
Solutions, Inc*

ORDER

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

DATED: April 8, 2019.

Thomas S. Balle

Thomas S. Zilly
United States District Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on [date] in the case of Nujud Muriby v. Experian Information Solutions, Inc., et al, Case No. 2:18-cv-01477-TSZ. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date:

City and State where sworn and signed:

Printed name:

Signature: